

¿ES LA INDUSTRIA BANCARIA SOSTENIBLE?: UN ANÁLISIS DE LA RELACIÓN ENTRE LA COMPOSICIÓN DE DEL CONSEJO DE ADMINISTRACIÓN DE LAS ENTIDADES FINANCIERAS Y LA DIVULGACIÓN DE LA RESPONSABILIDAD SOCIAL CORPORATIVA

IS THE BANKING INDUSTRY SUSTAINABLE?: AN ANALYSIS OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN BOARD COMPOSITION OF FINANCIAL ENTITIES AND CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY DISCLOSURE

María Consuelo Pucheta-Martínez

María Consuelo Pucheta Martínez is Ph.D., is Associate Professor at the University Jaume I of Castellón, Spain. Her research is currently focused on gender diversity in Boards of Directors, corporate governance and corporate social responsibility. He has published a wide range of articles in prestigious national and international journals.

Departamento de Finanzas y Contabilidad. Universidad Jaume I
Campus del Riu Sec, s/n
12071, Castellón, (Spain)
E-mail: pucheta@cofin.uji.es

Inmaculada Bel-Oms

Inmaculada Bel Oms is Ph.D. and is Lecturer Professor at the University of València, Spain.

Her research is currently focused on gender diversity in Boards of Directors, corporate governance and corporate social responsibility. He has published a wide range of articles in prestigious national and international journals.

Departamento de Finanzas Empresariales. University of Valencia.
Campus de Tarongers. Edifici Departamental Oriental. Av. dels Tarongers, s/n
46022, València, (Spain)
E-mail: inmaculada.bel@uv.es

Mehdi Nekhili

Mehdi Nekhili holds a PhD degree from the University of Burgundy in France. He is now Full Professor of Finance at Le Mans University (France). His main research interests include accounting, auditing, and corporate governance. He has published several papers in various refereed journals. He has also many chapters in books.and has edited a book entitled “International Banking Strategies”.

School of Law, Economics, and Business Administration. Le Mans University
Avenue Olivier Messiaen, Le Mans, 72085, (France)
E-mail: mehdi.nekhili@univ-lemans.fr

RESUMEN

Esta investigación tiene como objetivo explorar la asociación entre la composición del Consejo de Administración y la responsabilidad social corporativa (RSC) de una muestra de entidades financieras cotizadas, debatiendo las razones que llevan a estas entidades a divulgar información de RSC. La muestra de este estudio está compuesta por entidades financieras cotizadas en España, y el período analizado es de 2004 a 2015. Sin embargo, el número de observaciones es limitado porque en 2009 se reestructuró el sistema financiero español y las cajas de ahorros se fusionaron con los grandes bancos. Por lo que la muestra final incluye 159 observaciones. Nuestros resultados proporcionan evidencia de que la presencia de consejeros independientes y consejeras promueven la divulgación de la RSC. Además, los resultados también muestran que la presencia de consejeros ejecutivos e institucionales no influyen en los informes de RSC. Este estudio arroja luz sobre la influencia de la estructura del Consejo de Administración de las entidades financieras en la divulgación de la RSC.

ABSTRACT

This research aims at exploring the association between the board composition and corporate social responsibility (CSR) of a sample of listed financial entities, discussing the reasons driving these entities to disclose CSR information. The sample for this study is composed of Spanish listed financial firms, and the time period considered is 2004 to 2015. However, the number of observations is limited because in 2009, the Spanish financial system was restructured, and the savings banks were merged with the major banks. Thus, the final sample include 159 firm-year observations. Our findings provide evidence that the presence of independent directors and female directors on boards promotes CSR disclosure. Moreover, the results also show that the presence of inside directors and institutional directors on boards does not have an influence on CSR reporting. The paper sheds light on the influence of the board structure of financial entities on CSR disclosure.

PALABRAS CLAVE

Entidades financieras, informes de responsabilidad social corporativa, consejeros internos, consejeros externos, consejeras

KEY WORDS

Financial entities, corporate social responsibility reporting, insiders, outsiders, female directors

REFERENCIAS BIBLIOGRÁFICAS

Act 44/2002, of 22 November, on the Reform of the Financial System (BOE de 23 de noviembre).

Act 2/2011, of 4 March, Law for Sustainable Economy.

Act 3/2007, of 22 March, for Effective Equality between Women and Men (LOIMH).

Act 10/2014, of 26 June, de ordenación, supervisión y solvencia de entidades de crédito (BOE de 27 de junio).

Adams, R.B. and Ferreira, D. (2007). A theory of friendly boards. *Journal of Finance*, 62(1), pp. 217–250.

Aggarwal, R., Erel, I., Ferreira, M. and Matos, P. (2011). Does governance travel around the world?. Evidence from institutional investors. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 100(1), pp. 154–181.

Adams, R.B. and Funk, P. (2012). Beyond the glass ceiling: does gender matter? *Management science*, 58(2), pp. 219–235

Agrawal, A. and Mandelker, G.N. (1992). Shark repellents and the role of institutional investors in corporate governance. *Managerial and Decision Economics*, 13(1), pp. 15–22.

Aldama Report (2003). Informe de la Comisión Especial para el Fomento de la transparencia y la Seguridad en los Mercados Financieros y en las Sociedades Cotizadas. Ministerio de Economía y Hacienda, Madrid, España.

Alexandre, H. and Paquerot, M. (2000). Efficacité des structures de contrôle et enracinement des dirigeants. *Finance Contrôle Stratégie*, 3(2), pp. 5–29.

Almazan, A., Hartzell, J.C. and Starks, L. T. (2005). Active institutional shareholders and costs of monitoring: Evidence from executive compensation. *Financial Management*, 34(4), pp. 5–34.

Armstrong, C. S., Guay, W.R. and Weber, J.P. (2010). The role of information and financial reporting in corporate governance and debt contracting. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 50(2-3), pp. 179–234.

Bear, S., Rahman, N. and Post, C. (2010). The impact of board diversity and gender composition on corporate social responsibility and firm reputation. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 97(2), pp. 207–221.

Beatty, A. and Liao, S. (2015). *Does Loan Loss Provision Timeliness Affect the Accuracy, Informativeness, and Predictability of Analyst Provision Forecasts?*. The Ohio State University and University of Toronto Working Paper.

Boulila-Taktak, N. and Mbarki, I. (2014). Board characteristics, external auditing quality and earnings management: evidence from the Tunisian banks. *Journal of Accounting in Emerging Economies*, 4(1), pp. 79–96.

Boussaada, R. and Karmani, M. (2015). Did Board of Directors Have an Impact on MENA Bank Performance?. *International Journal of Economics and Finance*, 7(4), pp. 46–56.

Bose, S., Khan, H. Z., Rashid, A., & Islam, S. (2017). What drives green banking disclosure? An institutional and corporate governance perspective. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, pp. 1–27.

Bolton, L.E., Warlop, L. and Alba, J.W. (2003). Consumer perceptions of price (un)fairness. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 29, pp. 474–491.

Bravo, R., Mutate, J. and Pina, J. M. (2012). Corporate social responsibility as a vehicle to reveal the corporate identity: A study focused on the websites of Spanish financial entities. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 107(2), pp. 129-146.

Bravo-Urquiza, F. B., Navarro, M. C. A. and Trombetta, M. (2010). Disclosure theories and disclosure measures. *Spanish Journal of Finance and Accounting/Revista Española de Financiación y Contabilidad*, 39(147), pp. 393-420.

Brochet, F., Loumioti, M. and Serafeim, G. (2012). *Short-termism, investor clientele, and firm risk*. Working Paper 12-072, Harvard Business School, Harvard University.

Bushman, R., Chen, Q., Engel, E. and Smith, A. (2004). Financial accounting information, organizational complexity, and corporate governance systems. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 37(2), pp. 167-201.

Cabeza-García, L., Sacristán-Navarro, M. and Gómez-Ansón, S. (2017). Family involvement and corporate social responsibility disclosure. *Journal of Family Business Strategy*, 8(2), pp. 109-122.

Carcello, J.V. and Neal, T.L. (2003). Audit committee characteristics and auditor dismissals following “new” going-concern reports. *The Accounting Review*, 78(1), pp. 95-117.

Carnevale, C., Mazzuca, M. and Venturini, S. (2012). Corporate social reporting in European banks: The effects on a firm’s market value. *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 19(3), pp. 159-177.

Carter, D. A., Simkins, B.J. and Simpson, W.G. (2003). Corporate governance, board diversity, and firm value. *Financial review*, 38(1), pp. 33-53.

Carter, D., D’Souza, F.P., Simkins, B.J. and Simpson, W.G. (2007). *The diversity of corporate board committees and firm financial performance*. (March 15, 2007). Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=972763> or <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.972763>

Castelo-Branco, M. and Lima-Rodrigues, L. (2006). Communication of corporate social responsibility by Portuguese banks: A legitimacy theory perspective. *Corporate Communications: An International Journal*, 11(3), pp. 232-248.

Dalla Via, N., and Perego, P. (2018) Determinants of conflict minerals disclosure under the Dodd–Frank Act. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/bse.2030>.

Das, S. and Dixon, R. and Michael, A. (2015). *Corporate Social Responsibility Reporting: A Longitudinal Study of Listed Banking Companies in Bangladesh* (January 30, 2015). World Review of Business Research, 5(1), Jan 2015. Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2579814>

De Andres, P. and Valletudo, E. (2008). Corporate governance in banking: The role of the board of directors. *Journal of banking & finance*, 32(12), pp. 2570-2580.

Eagly, A.H. and Carli, L.L. (2007). Women and the labyrinth of leadership. *Harvard business review*, 85(9), pp. 63-71.

Elyasiani, E., Wen, Y. and Zhang, R. (2017). Institutional ownership and earning management by bank holding companies. *The Journal of Financial Research*, 40(2), pp. 147-178.

Eng, L.L. and Mak, Y.T. (2003). Corporate governance and voluntary disclosure. *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 22(4), pp. 325-45.

Esen, E. (2013). The influence of corporate social responsibility (CSR) activities on building corporate reputation. In *International business, sustainability and corporate social responsibility*, pp. 133-150. Emerald Group Publishing Limited.

Eurogroup (2012). *Statement on Spain*, 9 June 2012. <https://www.bde.es/f/webde/Secciones/SalaPrensa/Relacionados/eurogroup090612e.pdf>

Fairfax, L.M. (2010). The uneasy case for the inside director. *Iowa Law Review*, 96, pp. 127-193.

Fama, E.F. and Jensen, M.C. (1983). Separation of ownership and control. *The Journal of Law and Economics*, 26(2), pp. 301–325.

Fernandez-Feijoo, B., Romero, S. and Ruiz-Blanco, S. (2014). Women on boards: do they affect sustainability reporting? *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 21(6), pp. 351–364.

Frías-Aceituno, J.V., Rodríguez-Ariza, L. and García-Sánchez, I.M. (2013). Is integrated reporting determined by a country's legal system? An exploratory study. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 44, pp. 45–55.

Galbreath, J. (2015). Whither the Inside Director? A Study of Corporate Governance and CSR (WITHDRAWN). *Academy of Management Proceedings*. 2015(1). USA.

Galbreath, J. (2017). The impact of board structure on corporate social responsibility: a temporal view. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 26(3), pp. 358–370.

Gallego-Álvarez, I. and Ortas, E. (2017). Corporate environmental sustainability reporting in the context of national cultures: A quantile regression approach. *International Business Review*, 2, pp. 337-353.

García-Meca, E. and Pucheta-Martínez, M.C. (2018). How institutional investors on boards impact on stakeholder engagement and corporate social responsibility reporting. *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environment Management*, 25, pp. 237-249.

Garcia-Torea, N., Fernandez-Feijoo, B. and de la Cuesta, M. (2016). Board of director's effectiveness and the stakeholder perspective of corporate governance: Do effective boards promote the interests of shareholders and stakeholders?. *BRQ Business Research Quarterly*, 19(4), pp. 246-260.

Ghabayen, M.A., Mohamad, N.R. and Ahmad, N. (2016). Board characteristics and corporate social responsibility disclosure in the Jordanian banks. *Corporate Board: Role, Duties & Composition*, 12(1), pp. 84–100.

Gillan, S. and Starks, L. (2003). *Corporate governance, corporate ownership, and the role of institutional investors: A global perspective*. (August 2003). Weinberg Center for Corporate Governance Working Paper No. 2003-01. Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=439500>

Good Governance Code of Listed Companies (GGC). (2015). Acuerdo del Consejo de la Comisión Nacional del Mercado de Valores de 18 de febrero de 2015 sobre el código de buen gobierno de las sociedades cotizadas. CNMV. Madrid, España.

Hahn, T., Pinske, J., Preuss, L. and Figge, F. (2015). Tensions in corporate sustainability: towards an integrative framework. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 127, pp. 297-316.

Haniffa, R.M. and Cooke, T.E. (2002). Culture, corporate governance and disclosure in Malaysian corporations. *Abacus*, 38(3), pp. 317–349.

Hartzell, J.C. and Starks, L.T. (2003). Institutional investors and executive compensation. *Journal of Finance*, 58(6), pp. 2351–2374.

Heidrick and Struggles (2011). *Challenging board performance*. European report on corporate governance: Chicago, IL: Heidrick & Struggles

Heidrick & Struggles (2014). *Towards dynamics governance 2014. European corporate governance report*. Chicago, IL: Heidrick & Struggles

Hillman, A.J., Cannella, A.A. and Paetzold, R.L. (2000). The resource dependence role of corporate directors: Strategic adaptation of board composition in response to environmental change. *Journal of Management Studies*, 37(2), pp. 235–256.

Hillman, A.J. and Dalziel, T. (2003). Boards of directors and firm performance: Integrating agency and resource dependence perspectives. *Academy of Management Review*, 28(3), pp. 383–396.

Htay, S.N.N., Ab Rashid, H.M., Adnan, M.A. and Meera, A.K.M. (2012). Impact of corporate governance on social and environmental information disclosure of Malaysian listed banks: Panel data analysis. *Asian Journal of Finance & Accounting*, 4(1), pp. 1-24.

Ibrahim, N. A., Howard, D. P. and Angelidis, J. P. (2003). Board members in the service industry: An empirical examination of the relationship between corporate social responsibility orientation and directorial type. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 47(4), pp. 393–401.

Jensen, M. C. (1993). The modern industrial revolution, exit, and the failure of internal control systems. *The Journal of Finance*, 48(3), pp. 831–880.

Jensen, M.C. and Meckling, W.H. (1976). Theory of the firm: Managerial behavior, agency costs and ownership structure. *Journal of Financial Economics*, 3(4), pp. 305-360.

Jizi, M. (2017). The influence of board composition on sustainable development disclosure. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 26(5), pp. 640-655.

Jizi, M.I., Salama, A., Dixon, R. and Stratling, R. (2014). Corporate governance and corporate social responsibility disclosure: Evidence from the US banking sector. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 125(4), pp. 601–615.

Jo, H. and Harjoto, M.A. (2011). Corporate governance and firm value: The impact of corporate social responsibility. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 103(3), pp. 351–383.

Johnson, R.A. and Greening, D.W. (1999). The effects of corporate governance and institutional ownership types on corporate social performance. *The Academy of Management Journal*, 42(5), pp. 564–576.

Jones, C.D., Makri, M. and Gomez-Mejia, L.R. (2008). Affiliate directors and perceived risk bearing in publicly traded, family-controlled firms: The case of diversification. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 32(6), pp. 1007–1026.

Khan, H.U.Z. (2010). The effect of corporate governance elements on corporate social responsibility (CSR) reporting: Empirical evidence from private commercial banks of Bangladesh. *International Journal of Law and Management*, 52(2), pp. 82–109.

Kılıç, M., Kuzey, C. and Uyar, A. (2015). The impact of ownership and board structure on Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) reporting in the Turkish banking industry. *Corporate Governance*, 15(3), pp. 357–374.

Kim, H. (2013). *Glass fence thicker than glass ceiling: The puzzling gaps of women's leadership in Korea*. In J. Rajasekar (Ed.), Culture and gender in leadership: Perspectives from the Middle East and Asia, pp. 253–274. Hampshire, England: Palgrave Macmillan.

Laeven, L. (2013). Corporate governance: what's special about banks?. *Annual Review of Financial Economics*, 5(1), pp. 63–92.

Lanis, R., Richardson, G., Liu, C. and McClure, R. (2018). The impact of corporate tax avoidance on board of directors and CEO reputation. *Journal of Business Ethics*. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10551-018-3949-4>.

Landrum, N. E., and Ohsowski, B. (2018) Identifying worldviews on corporate sustainability: A content analysis of corporate sustainability reports. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 27(1), pp. 128–151.

Leventis, S., Dimitropoulos, P. and Owusu-Ansah, S. (2013). Corporate governance and accounting conservatism: Evidence from the banking industry. *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 21(3), pp. 264–286.

Levi, M., K. Li and F. Zhang (2014). Director Gender and Mergers and Acquisitions. *Journal of Corporate Finance*, 28, pp. 185–200.

Levine, R. (2005). Finance and growth: theory and evidence. *Handbook of economic growth*, 1(A), pp. 865–934.

Liao, L., Luo, L. and Tang, Q. (2015). Gender diversity, board independence, environmental committee and greenhouse gas disclosure. *The British Accounting Review*, 47(4), pp. 409-424.

Louizi, G. (2007). Role of the Board in Banks' Governance and Impact on Performance: Case of Tunisian Banks. *i-Manager's Journal on Management*, 2(3), pp. 38-55.

Lucas-Pérez, M.E., Minguez-Vera, A., Baixauli-Soler, J.S., Martín-Ugedo, J.F. and Sánchez-Marín, G. (2015). Women on the board and managers' pay: Evidence from Spain. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 129(2), pp. 265–280.

Marin, L., Ruiz, S. and Rubio, A. (2009). The role of identity salience in the effects of corporate social responsibility on consumer behavior. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 84(1), pp. 65–78.

Martínez-Ferrero, J., Vaquero-Cacho, L.A., Cuadrado-Ballesteros, B. and García-Sánchez, I.M. (2015). El gobierno corporativo y la responsabilidad social corporativa en el sector bancario: el papel del consejo de administración. *Investigaciones Europeas de Dirección y Economía de la Empresa*, 21(3), pp. 129–138.

Matsa D.A. and Miller A.R. (2013). A female style in corporate leadership? Evidence from quotas. *American Economic Journal*, 5(3), pp. 136–169

Mohd-Ghazali, N.A. (2007). Ownership structure and corporate social responsibility disclosure: some Malaysian evidence. *Corporate Governance: The International Journal of Business in Society*, 7(3), pp. 251–266.

Mozghovy, Y. and Ratnykova, I. (2011). *Correlation between the Corporate Social Responsibility and Financial Performance of the Bank in Ukrainian Context*. *Corporate Ownership and Control*, 8(2), pp. 120-130, 2011. Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2536878>

Muttakin, M.B., Khan, A. and Mihret, D.G. (2016). The effect of board capital and CEO power on corporate social responsibility disclosures. *Journal of Business Ethics*, pp. 1–16.

Nielsen, S. and Huse, M. (2010). The contribution of women on boards of directors: Going beyond the surface. *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 18(2), pp. 136–148.

Oh, C.H., Park, J.H. and Ghauri, P.N. (2013). Doing right, investing right: Socially responsible investing and shareholder activism in the financial sector. *Business Horizons*, 56(6), pp. 703–714.

Olivencia Report (1998). El Buen Gobierno de las Sociedades. Ministerio de Economía y Hacienda, Madrid, España.

Pathan, S. (2009). Strong boards, CEO power and bank risk-taking. *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 33(7), pp. 1340–1350.

Post, C., Rahman, N. and Rubow, E. (2011). Green governance: Boards of directors' composition and environmental corporate social responsibility. *Business & Society*, 50(1), pp. 189–223.

Prado-Lorenzo J.M. and García-Sánchez, I.M. (2010). The role of board of directors in disseminating relevant information on greenhouse gases. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 97(3), pp. 391–424.

Prior, F. and Argandoña, A. (2008). Best practices in credit accessibility and corporate social responsibility in financial institutions. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 87, pp. 251–265.

Pucheta-Martínez, M.C., Bel-Oms, I. and Olcina-Sempere, G. (2016). Corporate governance, female directors and quality of financial information. *Business Ethics: A European Review*, 25(4), pp. 363–385.

Rodríguez-Ariza, L., Aceituno, J.V.F. and Rubio, R.G. (2014). El consejo de administración y las memorias de sostenibilidad. *Revista de Contabilidad*, 17(1), pp. 5–16.

Rose, C. (2017). The relationship between corporate governance characteristics and credit exposure in banks: Implications for financial regulation. *European Journal of Law and Economics*, 43(1), pp. 167-194.

Rupp, D.E. and Mallory, D.B. (2015). Corporate social responsibility: psychological, person-centric, and progressing. *Annual Review of Organizational Psychology and Organizational Behavior*, 2, pp. 211-236.

Slawinski, N. and Bansal, P. (2015). Short on time: intertemporal tensions in business sustainability. *Organization Science*, 26, pp. 531-549.

Samara, G. and Berbegal-Mirabent, J. (2017). Independent directors and family firm performance: does one size fit all?. *International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal*, pp. 1–24.

Semenescu, A. and Curmei, C. V. (2015). Using CSR to mitigate information asymmetry in the banking sector. *Management & Marketing*, 10(4), pp. 316–329.

Sharif, M. and Rashid, K. (2014). Corporate governance and corporate social responsibility (CSR) reporting: an empirical evidence from commercial banks (CB) of Pakistan. *Quality & Quantity*, 48(5), pp. 2501–2521.

Shleifer, A. and Vishny, R. W. (1997). A survey of corporate governance. *Journal of Finance*, 52:, pp. 737-783.

Spanish CSR observatory (2014). *La responsabilidad social corporativa en las memorias anuales de las empresas del IBEX35. Análisis del ejercicio 2014*. Director Coordinador: Orenco Vázquez. Madrid, España.

Sundarason, S.D.D., Je-Yen, T. and Rajangam, N. (2016). Board composition and corporate social responsibility in an emerging market. *Corporate Governance: The International Journal of Business in Society*, 16(1), pp 35–53.

Truscott, R.A., Bartlett, J.L. and Tywoniak, S. A. (2009). The reputation of the corporate social responsibility industry in Australia. *Australasian Marketing Journal (AMJ)*, 17(2), pp. 84–91.

Unified Code of Corporate Governance (UCCG).(2006). Informe del Grupo Especial de Trabajo sobre Buen Gobierno de las Sociedades Cotizadas, Comité Conthe. Madrid, España.

Van Pelt, T. (2013). *The effect of board characteristics on dividend policy*. Tilburg: Tilburg University.

Vilar, V.H. and Simão, J. (2015). CSR disclosure on the web: major themes in the banking sector. *International Journal of Social Economics*, 42(3), pp. 296–318.

Wang, C., Xie, F. and Zhu, M. (2015). Industry expertise of independent directors and board monitoring. *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis*, 50(5), pp. 929–962.

Whidbee, D.A. (1997). Board composition and control of shareholder voting rights in the banking industry. *Financial Management*, 26 (4): pp. 27–41.

White Book in Spain on CSR (Libro Blanco de la RSE en España) (2006). Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales/nº424/4 de agosto de 2006. Madrid, Spain. <http://www.congreso.es>

Zahra, S.A. and Stanton, W.W. (1988). The implications of Board of Directors – composition on corporate strategy and performance, *International Journal of Management*, 5(2): pp. 229-236.